On the Another proof of Liapounov's theorem in the Central Limit Theorem

Ik-chan Kim

中心極限定理에 있어서 Liapounov 定理의 別證에 대하여

金益贊

Summary

In this paper, we shall study the another proof that the normalized sum converges in distribution to a random variable that is normal with mean and variance 1 by comparing the expectation of test function,

of proofs of the theorem under such restrictions.

1. Introduction

Let X_1, X_2, \cdots be independent random variables $(r_0v's)$ with each X_j having finite mean μ_j and finite variance δ_j^3 . Let $S_n = \sum_{j=1}^n X_j$, $n = 1, 2, \cdots$; then $E(S_n) = \sum_{j=1}^n \mu_j$, Var $S_n = s_n^2 = \sum_{j=1}^n \delta_j^2$.

We consider normalized sum $S_n^* = s_n^{-1}(S_n - E(S_n))$ which has mean 0 and variance 1 assuming that $s_n > 0$ for sufficiently large *n*. If X^* is a r.v. having the normal distribution with mean 0 and variance 1, N(0, 1), so that the distribution function (df) of X^* is

Let F_i be the df of X_i , f_i be the Characteristic function (Ch.f) of X_i , F_n^* be the df of S_n^* and $g_n(t)$ be the Ch.f of r.v. S_n^* . We shall investigate the conditions, especially Liapounov's, under which S_n^* converges in distribution to X^* and the method

2. Converges to a Normal Distribution

I. Let F be a df of r.v. X and $E(X) = \mu$, if $\int_{-\infty}^{\infty} |X|^n dF(x)$ exists and is finite, then the Ch.f f(t) of F may be written as

where

$$R_n(t) = t^n \int_0^1 \frac{(1-u)^{n-1}}{(n-1)!} f^{(n)}(tu) du \quad \dots \dots \quad (3)$$

and

$$f^{(i)}(t) = \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} (ix)^{j} e^{itx} dF(x),$$

$$f^{(j)}(0) = i^{j} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} x^{j} dF(x) = i^{j} \mu_{j}$$

Also

- 167 -

$$R_n(t) = \frac{(it)^n}{n!} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} x^n dF(x) + o(t^n), \quad \dots \quad (4)$$

where $o(t^{*})$ denotes a function of t such that

$$\frac{o(t^n)}{t^n} \longrightarrow 0 \text{ as } t \to \infty.$$

Furthermore

$$|R_n(t)| = \theta \frac{|t^n|}{n!} \int_{-\infty}^{-\infty} |x|^n dF(x), \quad |\theta| \leq 1 \cdots (5)$$

for every real t.

Pf. The exponential function satisfies

$$e^{v} = 1 + \sum_{j=1}^{n-1} \frac{v^{j}}{j!} + r_{n}(v),$$

where

$$r_n(v) = \frac{v^n}{(n-1)!} \int_0^1 (1-u)^{n-1} \frac{d^n}{du^n} (e^{uv}) du,$$

or

$$r_n(v) = \frac{v^n}{n!} + o(v^n).$$

If we place v by it x and take expected values, we obtain (3) and (4). Also (5) is obtained by applying) the Maclaurin expansion theorem of calculus to f(t).

I. Liapounov's inequality

Lat X and Y be r. v's, $0 and <math>p^{-1}+q^{-1}=1$, Hölder's inequality

$$E(|XY|) \leq \{E(|X|^{p})\}^{1/p}, \{E(|Y|^{q})\}^{1/q} \dots \dots (6)$$

If $Y \equiv 1$ in (6) we obtain

$$E(|X|) \leqslant \{E(|X|)\}^{1/2}$$

Replacing |X| by $|X|^r$, where 1 < r < p and writing s = pr we obtain the Liapounov's inequality;

$$E(|X|^r)^{1/r} \leq E(|X|^s)^{1/s}, \ 1 < r < s \ \langle \infty, \dots, (7) \rangle$$

Theorem. Let $S_n = \sum_{j=1}^n X_j$ $n=1, 2\cdots$, where the X_j are independent r, v's with μ_j and σ_j^2 , they are finite. Let $S_n^* = s_n^{-1}(S_n - E(S_n))$, where $s_n^2 = \sum_{j=1}^n \sigma_j^2$ and let F_j be the df of X_j . If for every $\epsilon > 0$,

$$\frac{1}{s_n^2}\sum_{j=1}^n\int_{\substack{\{x: |x-\mu_j|\geq \epsilon s^n\}}} (x-\mu_j)^2 dF_j(x) - 0$$

as $n \to \infty$. (8)

then S_n^* converges in distribution to X^* . This theorem implies that $S^* \longrightarrow X^*$ under any one of the following conditions,

1) The uniformly bounded case.

Assume $|X_j| \leq M$ for all j, and $s_n \longrightarrow \infty$.

Then

$$\int \frac{(x-\mu_j)^2 dF_j(x)}{\{x: |x-\mu_j| \ge \epsilon s_n\}}$$

= $E[(X_j-\mu_j)^2 I\{|X_j-\mu_j| \ge \epsilon s_n\}]$
 $\leqslant \frac{(2M)^2 \sigma_j^2}{\epsilon^2 s_n^2}$ (6)

by Chebyshev's inequality. Thus

$$\frac{1}{s_n^2}\sum_{j=1}^n\int_{\substack{\{x: |x-\mu_j|\geq \epsilon s_n\}}} \frac{(x-\mu_j)^2 dF_j(x) \leqslant \frac{(2M)^2}{\epsilon^2 s_n^2}}{\epsilon^2 s_n^2} \longrightarrow 0^*$$

2) The identically distributed case.

Assume that the X_i are independent identically distributed r. v's with finite μ and finite $\sigma^2 > 0$, then

$$(8) = \frac{1}{n\sigma^2} \sum_{i=1}^n \int_{\substack{\{x : |x-\mu| \ge \epsilon \sqrt{n}\}}} \frac{(x-\mu)^2 dF(x)}{e^{\sqrt{n}}} dF(x)$$

- 168 -

since σ^1 is finite and $\{x : |x-\mu| \ge \epsilon \delta \sqrt{n}\} \downarrow \phi as n \to \infty$.

3) The Bernoulli case.

Let S_n be the number of success in *n* Bernoulli trials, with probability of success p on a given trial. We may write

$$S_n = X_1 + X_2 + \cdots + X_n,$$

where the X_i are independent and $P(X_i=1)=p$, $P(X_i=0)=q=1-p$. We may take X_i as the indicator of a success on trial j, thus case 2 applies with $\mu = E(X_i) = p, \sigma^2 = E(X_i^2) - \{E(X_i)\}^2$ $=p(1-p), E(S_n)=n\mu=np, S_n^2=n\sigma^2=np(1-p),$ Thus

$$S_n^* = \frac{S_n - np}{(npq)^{1/2}}$$
(11)

and

$$S_n^* \xrightarrow{d} X^*$$
, that is, $P(S_n^* \leq x) \longrightarrow \Phi(x)$
for all x .

4) Liapounov's condition.

Assume that

for some $\delta > 0$.

where $E[|X_i - \mu_i|^{2+\epsilon}]$ exist. Then

$$E\left(|X_{j}-\mu_{j}|^{2+s}\right) = \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} |x-\mu_{j}|^{2+s} dF_{j}(x)$$
$$\geqslant \int_{\left\{x: 1 \mid x-\mu_{j}\right\} \ge \epsilon s_{n}} |x-\mu_{j}|^{2} dF_{j}(x)$$

$$\geqslant \epsilon^{s} s_{n} \int_{\{x: |x-\mu_{j}| \ge \epsilon s_{n}\}} (x-\mu_{j})^{2} dF_{j}(x)$$

Thus

$$(8) \leqslant \frac{1}{s_n^2} \sum_{j=1}^n \frac{E\left[|X_j - \mu_j|^{2+\epsilon}\right]}{\epsilon^{\epsilon} s_n^{\epsilon}}$$
$$= \frac{\sum_{j=1}^n E\left[|X_j - \mu_j|^{2+\epsilon}\right]}{\epsilon^{\epsilon} s_n^{2+\epsilon}} \longrightarrow 0.$$

Now we shall show that Theorem holds under case 4). Let $E(|X_j|^3) = \gamma_j$ and $\Gamma_n = \sum_{j=1}^n \gamma_j = \sum_{j=1}^n E(|X_j|^3)$. To prove Theorem in (12) we need only show that $g_n(t) \longrightarrow e^{-\frac{t^2}{2}}$ or $\log g_n(t) \longrightarrow -\frac{t^2}{2}$ as $n \longrightarrow \infty$. Furthermore we may assume without loss of generality that all $\mu_i = 0$ and that the r. v's X_i all have finite third moments, that is, $\delta = 1$.

Proof 1.

The condition (12) in case 4) is written as

$$\Gamma_n/s_n^3 \longrightarrow 0.$$
 (13)

By I, the Ch.f $f_i(t)$ of X_i has the expansion:

$$f_{i}(t) = 1 - \frac{1}{2}\sigma_{i}^{2}t^{3} + \frac{1}{6}E(X_{i}^{3})(it)^{3} + o[E(X_{i}^{3})t^{3}]$$
.....(14)

The Ch f g(t) of the r, v, S is given by

$$g_{n}(t) = \prod_{j=1}^{n} f_{j}\left(\frac{t}{S_{n}}\right) = \prod_{j=1}^{n} \left\{ 1 - \frac{\sigma_{j}^{2}}{2S_{n}^{2}} t^{2} + \frac{E(X_{j}^{3})}{6S_{n}^{3}} (it)^{3} + 0 \left(\frac{E(X_{j}^{3})t^{3}}{S_{n}^{3}} \right) \right\}.$$
 (15)

Writing

$$\eta_{i} = -\frac{\sigma_{i}^{2}}{2s_{n}^{3}}t^{3} + \frac{E(X_{i}^{3})}{6s_{n}^{3}}(it^{3}) + 0\left(\frac{E(X_{i}^{3})t^{3}}{s_{n}^{3}}\right)$$

we note that :

$$\sum_{j=1}^{n} \eta_{j} = -\frac{t^{2}}{2} + \frac{1}{6s_{n}^{3}} (it)^{3} \sum_{j=1}^{n} E(X_{j}^{3}) + \sum_{j=1}^{n} \left(\frac{E(X_{j}^{3})t^{3}}{s_{n}^{3}} \right)$$

step 1: $\eta_j \longrightarrow 0$ for all j, uniformly in j as $n \rightarrow \infty$. Clearly the o-term $\longrightarrow 0$ as $n \longrightarrow \infty$. Recalling(7)

$$\{E(|X_j|^3)\}^{1/3} = \sigma_j \leq \{E(|X_j|^3)\}^{1/3},\$$

we obtain

$$0 \leqslant \frac{\sigma_{1}^{2}}{2s_{n}^{2}} t^{2} \leqslant \frac{1}{2} [\Upsilon_{1}]^{2/3} \frac{t^{2}}{s_{n}^{2}} \leqslant \frac{1}{2} [\Gamma_{n}]^{2/3} \cdot \frac{t^{2}}{s_{n}^{2}}$$

The first and trird inequalities are obvious and, by (13), the upper bound on the right hand side tends to zero as $n \rightarrow \infty$, *i.e*;

$$\frac{1}{2} \cdot \frac{\sigma^2}{s_n^2} \cdot t^2 \longrightarrow 0, \text{ uniformly in } j \text{ as } n \longrightarrow \infty$$

Finally

$$0 \leq \left| \frac{1}{6} \cdot \frac{E(X_j^3)}{s_n^3} (it)^3 \right| \leq \frac{1}{6} \cdot \frac{\gamma_j^{i} t_j^{i}}{s_n^3}$$
$$\leq \frac{1}{6} \cdot \frac{|t|^3}{s_n^3} \Gamma_n.$$

By (13) the quantity on the right tends to zero as $n \rightarrow \infty$, *i.e.*;

$$\frac{1}{6} \cdot \frac{E(X_j^3)}{s_n^3} (it)^3 \longrightarrow 0,$$

uniformly in j as $n \longrightarrow \infty$.

step 2: Given $\epsilon > 0$, $0 < \epsilon < \frac{1}{2}$, we can find $N(t, \epsilon)$ such that for $n > N(t, \epsilon)$, $|\eta_j| < \epsilon$ for all $j \le n$. Using the logarithmic expansion we obtain

where

$$\psi(\eta_j) = \sum_{r=2}^{\infty} (-1)^{r+1} \frac{1}{\gamma} \eta_j^{r-2}$$

However

since $(2+r')^{-1} < \frac{1}{2}$ for all $r' \ge 1$ and since η_j tends to zero uniformly in j. The logarithm of the Ch.f $g_n(t)$ of S_n^* may be written as follows;

step 3:
$$\sum_{j=1}^{n} \overline{\gamma}_{j}^{\mathbf{a}} \psi(\overline{\gamma}_{j}) \longrightarrow 0$$
 as $n \longrightarrow \infty$
By (17), $\left| \sum_{j=1}^{n} \overline{\gamma}_{j}^{\mathbf{a}} \psi(\overline{\gamma}_{j}) \right| \leq \sum_{j=1}^{n} \overline{\gamma}_{j}^{\mathbf{a}} \left| \psi(\overline{\gamma}_{j}) \right| \leq \sum_{j=1}^{n} \overline{\gamma}_{j}^{\mathbf{a}}$,

Now, let show $\sum_{j=1}^{n} \eta_j^2 \longrightarrow 0$ as $n \longrightarrow \infty$.

$$\left|\sum_{j=1}^{n} \mathcal{T}_{j}^{2}\right| \leq \left(1 - \frac{|t|^{4}}{4s_{n}^{4}} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sigma_{j}^{4} + \left(2 - \frac{|t|^{6}}{36} \sum_{s=0}^{n} \sum_{j=1}^{n} (\mathcal{T}_{j})^{2}\right)\right)$$

- 170 -

$$+ \left(3 \sum_{j=1}^{n} \left(0 \left(\frac{t^{3}}{s_{n}^{3}} E(X_{j}^{3}) \right) \right)^{-2} + \left(3 \left(\frac{t^{3}}{6s_{n}^{5}} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sigma_{j}^{2} \gamma_{j} \right) \right)^{-2} + \left(3 \left(\frac{t^{2}}{s_{n}^{2}} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \sigma_{j}^{2} \right)^{2} \right)^{-2} \left(0 \left(\frac{E(X_{j}^{3})t^{3}}{s_{n}^{3}} \right)^{-2} \right)^{-2} \right)^{-2} + \left(3 \left(\frac{t^{2}}{s_{n}^{3}} \sum_{j=1}^{n} \gamma_{j} \right)^{2} \right)^{-2} \left(0 \left(\frac{E(X_{j}^{3})t^{3}}{s_{n}^{3}} \right)^{-2} \right)^{-2} \right)^{-2} \right)^{-2}$$

Appealing twice to (7) we have

$$\frac{\sum_{j=1}^{n} \sigma_{j}^{4}}{S_{n}^{4}} \leqslant \frac{\sum_{j=1}^{n} [\gamma_{j}]^{4/3}}{S_{n}^{4}} \leqslant \frac{\Gamma_{n}}{S_{n}^{3}}$$

and the upper bound tends to zero by (13), this taket care of ①.

Next, by expanding the square on the right that

$$\frac{\sum_{j=1}^{n} [\gamma_j]^2}{S_n^6} \leqslant \left(\frac{\Gamma_n}{S_n^2}\right)^2$$

add upper bound of 2 tends to zero.

Also (3) tends to zero because of the o(s), so do (5) and (6). Finally (4) satisfies

$$|t|^{\frac{\sum_{j=1}^{n}\sigma_{j}^{2}\gamma_{j}}}_{s_{n}^{5}} \leq \frac{\Gamma_{n}}{s_{n}^{\gamma}} \cdot |t|^{5}$$

since $\sigma_j^2 \leq s_n^2$, $j=1, 2, \dots, n$. The upper bounds on the right go to zero as $n \longrightarrow \infty$ by (13), hence completes the proof of step3.

step 4:
$$\sum_{j=1}^{n} \eta_j^2 + \frac{t^2}{2} \to 0$$
 as $n \to \infty$
We have;

$$\left|\sum_{j=1}^{n} \overline{\eta}_{j}^{2} + \frac{t^{2}}{2}\right| \leq \frac{|t|^{3}}{6s^{3}} \Gamma_{n} + \sum_{j=1}^{n} 0 \left(\frac{E(X_{j}^{3})t^{3}}{s^{3}} \right)$$

and both on the right tend to zero as $n \rightarrow \infty$. The first by (13) and the second because of the small o.

We conculude that

$$\log g_n(t) \longrightarrow -\frac{t^2}{2}$$

for every t and so complete the proof of Theorem.

Let proceed to another proof of Theorem by the idea that is to approximate the sum S_n successively by replacing one X at a time with a normal r. v. Y.

Proof 2.

Let $\{Y_i; j \ge 1\}$ be r.v's having $N(0, \sigma_i^*)$, thus Y_i has the same mean and variance as the corresponding X_i ; let all the X's and Y's be totally independent.

Now put

$$Z_{j} = Y_{1} + Y_{2} + \cdots + Y_{j-1} + X_{j+1} + \cdots + X_{n}, \quad 1 \le j \le n,$$

with the convension that

$$Z_1 = X_2 + \cdots + X_n, \quad Z_n = Y_1 + \cdots + Y_{n-1}.$$

We now write

$$f(X_1+X_2+\cdots+X_n)-f(Y_1+\cdots+Y_n)$$
$$=\sum_{j=1}^n \left\{f(X_j+Z_j)-f(Y_j+Z_j)\right\}.$$

Let estimate the difference for a suitable class of function f to compare the distribution of $(X_j + Z_j)/s_n$ with that of $(Y_j + Z_j)/s_n$. *i.e.*;

$$E\left\{f(\frac{X_1+\cdots+X_n}{S_n})\right\} - E\left\{f(\frac{Y_1+\cdots+Y_n}{S_n})\right\}$$
$$= \sum_{j=1}^n \left[E\left\{f(\frac{X_j+Z_j}{S_n})\right\} - E\left\{f(\frac{Y_j+Z_j}{S_n})\right\}\right]. (19)$$

On the other hand, if we take f in C^3 , the class of bounded continuous function with three bounded continuous derivatives, it suffices to show that

- 171 -

 $E\{f(S_n^*)\} \longrightarrow E\{f(X^*)\}.$ Now by Taylor's Th, we have for every x and y;

Now by faylor 5 1 k, we have for every 2 and 5 k

$$\left| f(x+y) - \left(f(x) + f'(x)y + \frac{f'(x)}{2}y^2 \right) \right| \leq \frac{M|y|^3}{6}$$

where $M = \sup_{x \in \mathbb{R}^{1}} |f^{(3)}(x)|$.

Hence if ξ and η are independent r.v's such that $E\{|\eta|^3\} < \infty$, by substitution and integration,

$$|E\{f(\xi+\eta)\} - E\{f(\xi)\} - E\{f'(\xi)\}E\{\eta\} - \frac{1}{2}E\{f'(\xi)E\{\eta^{2}\}\} | \leq \frac{M}{6}E\{|\eta^{2}|\}$$
(20)

since the r. v's $f(\xi)$, $f'(\xi)$ and $f''(\xi)$ are bounded hence integrable.

If ζ is another r.v. independent of ξ and having the same mean and variance as η , and $E\{|\zeta|^3\} < 8$, we obtain by replacing η with ζ and taking the difference;

$$|E\{f(\xi+\eta)\} - E\{f(\xi+\zeta)\}| \leq \frac{M}{6}E\{|\eta|^{\mathfrak{s}} + |\zeta|^{\mathfrak{s}}\}.$$
(21)

Appling to the right side of (19) with $\zeta = \frac{Z_j}{S_n}$, $\eta = \frac{X_j}{S_n}$, $\zeta = \frac{X_j}{S_n}$ and the bounds on the right-hand side of (21) then add up to

where $c = \sqrt{8/\pi}$ since the absolute third moment of $N(0, \sigma^2)$ is equal to $c\sigma_j^2 \cdot By(7), \sigma_j^3 \leq \gamma_j$, so that the quantity in (22) is $o(\Gamma_n/s_n^3)$. We have thus obtained the following estimate;

$$\forall f \in C^3$$
; $|E\{f(S_n^*) - E\{f(X^*)\} \leq o(\frac{\Gamma_n}{S_n^3})$

and under (13) this converges to zero as $n \rightarrow \infty$. Hence

$$E\{f(S_n^*)\} \longrightarrow E\{f(X^*)\} \text{ as } n \to \infty,$$

Example :

Let $\epsilon > 0$ and $f_{\epsilon} \epsilon C^{3}$

$$f_{\varepsilon}(x) = \begin{cases} 1 & ifx \leq 0\\ [1-(x\epsilon^{-1})^{\epsilon}]^{\epsilon} & if0 \leq x \leq \epsilon\\ 0 & ifx \geq \epsilon \end{cases}$$

Then

$$\phi(-x+\epsilon) \ge \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} f_{\xi}(x+y) \ d\phi(y) \ge \phi(-x), \quad x \in \mathbb{R}$$

Similarly

$$F_n^*(-x+\epsilon) \ge \int_{-\pi}^{\pi} f_{\varepsilon}(x+y) dF_n^*(y) \ge F_n^*(-x),$$

x\epsilon R,

since
$$\lim_{n \to \infty} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} f(x+y) dF_n^*(y) = \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} f(x+y) d\Phi(y)$$

for any x (uniformly in x), $f \in C^3$ (Ref [6]) We conclude that

$$\frac{\lim_{n \to \infty} F_n^*(-x) \ge \lim_{n \to \infty} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} f_{\varepsilon}(x+y) \, dF_n^*(y)}{= \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} f(x+y) \, d\Phi(y) \le \Phi(-x+\epsilon)}$$

and

$$\frac{\lim_{n\to\infty}}{\lim_{n\to\infty}}F_n^*(-x+\epsilon) \ge \lim_{n\to\infty}\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}f_{\varepsilon}(x+y) \ dF_n^*(y)$$
$$= \int_{-\infty}^{\infty}f_{\varepsilon}(x+y) \ d\Phi(y) \ge \Phi(-x) \ \cdots \cdots \cdots \cdots \cdots (23)$$

for all real x and $\epsilon > 0$. By (23),

$$\lim_{n\to\infty} F_n^* (-x) \ge \Phi(-x-\epsilon),$$

and we get

- 172 -

On the Another proof of Liapounov's theorem in the Central Limit Theorem 7

$$\Phi(-x-\epsilon) \leqslant \lim_{n \to \infty} F_n^*(-x) \leqslant \lim_{n \to \infty} F_n^*(-x)$$
 for all $x \in \mathbb{R}$ and $\epsilon > 0$. Since ϵ is arbitrary,
$$\leqslant \Phi(-x+\epsilon)$$
 $\lim_{n \to \infty} F_n^*((-x) = \Phi(-x), \quad x \in \mathbb{R}.$

Literature Cited

- 1. Ash, R.B. 1972, Real Analysis and Probability.
- 2. Billingsley, P. 1968, Convergence of Probability Measures
- 3. Chung, K.L. 1974, A Course in Probability Theory
- 4. Eisen, M. 1969, Introduction to Mathematical Probability Theory
- 5. Neuts, M.F. 1973, Probability
- 6. Rohatgi, V.K. 1976, An Introduction to Probability Theory and Mathematical Stasistics

《國文抄錄》

中心 極限定理에 있어서 Liapounov 定理의 別證에 對하여

本 論文에서는 Liapounov의 條件下에서 中心極限定理가 成立한다는 사실을 C³의 범위안에서 test function을 비교함에 의하여 고찰하고 實例로서 이를 確認하였다.